

Wadsley's claim that IMAS science is wrong

Andrew Wadsley has made several recent statements in the media (e.g. Tasmania Times 26/8/2012) that Neira's (2011) calculation of spawning biomass is wrong and that the results cannot be reproduced.

Wadsley's concerns relate to the mortality model shown in Figure 8 and Table 3.1 of Neira (2011). He has attempted to repeat this analysis using exponential curve fitting in Microsoft Excel, an approach that uses ordinary least squares (OLS). This differs substantially from the methods used by Neira – non-linear least squares (NLS) (Lo *et al.* 1996), and a generalised linear model approach with a negative binomial error distribution (Cubillos *et al.* 2007).

Fisheries scientists at IMAS have repeated the analysis presented by Neira 2011, confirming the results presented in the report. These results have recently been independently and externally reviewed by SARDI and found to be both repeatable and appropriate.

The Daily Egg Production Method (DEPM) used by Neira (2011) is well supported in the international peer reviewed literature and appropriate for the analysis (see Neira & Lyle 2011 and the references contained within).

References

- Cubillos, L.A., Ruiz, P., Claramunt, G., Gacitúa, S. *et al.* (2007). Spawning, daily egg production, and spawning stock biomass estimation for common sardine (*Strangomera bentincki*) and anchovy (*Engraulis ringens*) off central southern Chile in 2002. *Fisheries Research* 86: 228-240.
- Lo, N.C.H., Ruiz, Y.A.G., Cervantes, M.J., Moser, H.G. and Lynn, R.J. (1996). Egg production and spawning biomass of Pacific sardine (*Sardinops sagax*) in 1994, determined by the daily egg production method. *CalCOFI Report* 37: 160-174.
- Neira, F.J. 2011. Application of daily egg production to estimate biomass of jack mackerel, *Trachurus declivis* – a key fish species in the pelagic ecosystem of south-eastern Australia. Final Report to the Winifred Violet Scott Charitable Trust, Fisheries Aquaculture and Coasts Centre, Institute for Marine and Antarctic Studies (IMAS), University of Tasmania. 42 pp.
- Neira, FJ and Lyle, JM, 2011. DEPM-based spawning biomass of *Emmelichthys nitidus* (Emmelichthyidae) to underpin a developing mid-water trawl fishery in south-eastern Australia. *Fisheries Research*. 110: 236-243.
- Wadsley, A. Super Trawler: The UTAS Vice-Chancellor must investigate. Tasmania Times 2012-08-26. <http://tasmaniantimes.com/index.php?/weblog/article/super-trawler-the-utas-vice-chancellor-must-investigate/>