

**Meeting of the Independent Expert Group (IEG) for Gunns Pulp Mill
Minutes 29 August**

Date: Fri 29 Aug 2008 Time: 10am – 5.00pm

**Rm G38, Commonwealth Parliamentary Offices
4 Treasury Place
Melbourne**

Attendees

The Hon Peter Garrett	Minister	➤➤ (Part only)
Professor Frank Larkins	IEG (Chair)	➤➤
Dr Mike Herzfeld	IEG	➤➤
Dr Graeme Batley	IEG	➤➤
Professor Helene Marsh	IEG	➤➤
Professor Paul Haddad	IEG	➤➤
Dr David Westcott	IEG	➤➤
Rob Joy	ISS	➤➤
Peter Burnett	DEWHA	➤➤
Mike Smith	DEWHA	➤➤
Katie Febey	DEWHA	➤➤
Olga Braga	DEWHA	➤➤
David Pinch	DEWHA	➤➤
Chris Hicks	DEWHA (Secretariat)	➤➤
John Derwin	Gunns	➤➤ (part only)
Lawson Harding	Gunns	➤➤ (part only)
Ian Woodward	Pitt & Sherry	➤➤ (part only)
Peter Ryder	Poyry	➤➤ (part only)

**Meeting of the Independent Expert Group (IEG) for Gunns Pulp Mill
Minutes 29 August**

Time	Item	Topic
10.10	1	<p>Welcome / Apologies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Chair opened the meeting at 10.10 and welcomed participants noting that David Westcott was attending his first meeting as an IEG member. ○ It was noted that all IEG meetings and IEG DEWHA consultations should be considered as in confidence.
	2	<p>Confirm Agenda</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Timing of Minister's and Gunns' arrivals noted and Agenda confirmed
	3	<p>Review/Accept Draft Minutes (25 July 2008)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ IEG agreed minutes factually accurate. Chair requested unnecessary personal attributions be removed prior to their acceptance at the next IEG meeting <p>ACTION: Correct draft minutes from 25 July to remove attributions (#1)</p>
	4	<p>Report on Action Items (25 July 2008)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ IEG noted all action items resolved or where unresolved would be considered at this meeting. ○ DEWHA noted that 'residual risk' relating to the Xanthorrhoea dune crossing under Item 5.2 had been addressed (Mark Wapstra providing written confirmation that no Xanthorrhoea present on the revised route).
	5	<p>Conflicts of Interest</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None raised.
	6	<p>Report on World Congress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ IEG member Graeme Batley was the Chair of this Congress that had a special session on pulp mills with a number of overseas presenters. ○ A meeting was held with Canadian pulp mill researcher Mark Hewitt (and Lawson Harding (Gunns) and Rick Krasso (Ecotox Services Australasia)). In his recent review, Hewitt had identified that no standard methods currently existed for testing for endocrine disruption in marine organisms (gonad size increase has been used in a freshwater environment). It was noted that Hewitt et al. are to do testing of proposed protocols in Brazilian mill in saltwater context and agreed to provide results to Gunns (this would take 12 months or more and may not be useful for Gunns project). ○ The names of other Canadians providing advice on pulp mills in South America were passed on to DEWHA. ○ IEG noted that endocrine disruption was not likely to be a major issue if likely causative toxicants were not identified in the effluent.
	7	<p>Module Submission Schedule</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ DEWHA provided an update of progress ○ Modules attributed to 3 groups: ○ 'Simple' Modules (Terrestrial and Construction) – C1, D and I-J ○ 'Moderate' Modules (some larger issues to resolve) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – O:shortcomings with reserves and offsets. – F,G,H,K: Noise study, night-time work issues. ○ 'Complex' Modules (N,M,L and CBOMP) - require IEG expertise today to consider complex issues of these modules (Note: progress behind the original schedule)

8 Gunns Condition Variation Request

- DEWHA noted Gunns' request for condition variation had been kept to minimum – replacement of maps at Schedule 1.

IEG discussed the 5 changes to the pipeline route:

- 1. Dillston bypass: This change to the pipe line route was not in train when project commenced and was out of Gunns' control.
- 2. Landowner request: Possible reduced impact as a result of new route Dept. noted all routes surveyed and no matters of NES to consider.
- 3. Powerstation: Not proposed at project commencement.
- 4. Georgetown: Council wants the pipeline route moved for expansion and a landowner is not happy. Therefore 2 routes – given both routes surveyed and no matters of NES.
- 5. Dune crossing: Gap through *Xanthorrhoea* identified and route over bass link workable.
- IEG questioned need for further seasonal studies, DEWHA responded that surveys complete for all areas in modules FGHK

IEG noted no objections to pipeline route variations as proposed

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

Penguin/Seal monitoring (meeting early Sept)

- DEWHA tabled email of 19 August from Gunns.
IEG noted final report from Tas Govt. not yet available but indications from Tas that they are broadly satisfied with Gunns proposal.

ACTION: Hold meeting with Tas Govt and Gunns when the toxicological report is complete (#3)

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

[REDACTED]

11.30-
12.30

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

12.30-
1.00

1.00-
1.15

1.15-
1.45

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S36

General matters considered

- Gunns sought advice in regard to the process of assessing modules.
- IEG noted module submission dates, noted Gunns work to date but highlighted that where contingency measures are necessary to meeting conditions they should be included in modules for consideration and approval.
- Gunns noted that they would like more sessions like today's.
- IEG agreed they would occur on an as needs basis.

Gunns component finished at 2.45pm

2.45-3.00

Break

3.00-3.30

**13 Review of progress with Modules
Module D**

- (Mod D) Noise calculations.

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S36

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

3.30-4-30

14 Meeting with the Minister

Minister arrived at 3.40pm

- The IEG Chair gave the Minister an outline of progress of the meeting to date
- The Minister noted his appreciation of the work the IEG and DEWHA had undertaken and acknowledged that the objective of IEG involvement and focus of resources was to eliminate uncertainty from the decision-making process and ensure Gunns meet the principles of world's best practice in relation to matters of national environmental significance potentially impacted by the proposed mill, in accordance with the approval conditions.
- The Chair outlined the timing requirements for the completion of modelling in relation to the commissioning of the mill and in respect to the approval process.
- The Minister initiated a discussion on potential external effects that may affect modelling accuracy (eg. climate change) and IEG identified wind and tide as first order effects that would not be significantly impacted by anticipated climate change, but they noted they were very variable effects and hard to gauge.
- IEG noted that the pulp mill expert was still to be appointed, and required as soon as possible to resolve issues with modules M,N,L.
- The Minister noted that Gunns had not yet sought an extension and DEWHA noted that they would be meeting with Gunns on the following Monday regarding the deadline issue.
- The Minister asked for views on likely timeframes and IEG/DEWHA responded that it was largely dependent on a concerted effort by Gunns to immediately and thoroughly address issues identified by DEWHA/IEG.
- Minister departed the meeting 4.30pm.

4.30

[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER S 36

		<p>Module C1 – Mill Construction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Discussed, with agreement that DEWHA would bring all the straightforward modules (C1 and I-J) to the IEG asap for consideration and possible out of session approval
		<p>Module D – Wharf Construction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ IEG noted that Module D would require consideration of the wharf noise study and take more time
		<p>Modules IJ – Solid Waste & Reservoir</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Discussed, with agreement that DEWHA would bring all the straightforward modules (C1 and I-J) to the IEG ASAP for consideration and possible out of session approval
		<p>Module O – Offsets and Reserves</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ IEG noted that module O has difficulties with regard to rehabilitation plans for reserve areas and legal interpretation of reserves and what is required satisfying of relevant conditions by 4 October. ○ DEWHA noted that Gunns had stated they did not intend to do more major studies or research in order to address conditions but that they would make appropriate improvements to the module.
	16	<p>ISS update</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ ISS has not visited the site since reporting to the last IEG meeting ○ DEWHA reported on the clearing undertaken for geotechnical work ○ DEWHA noted that Tas Govt was on site and had not identified any problems to report. ○ It was noted that the perimeter fencing had not yet been completed.
	17	<p>Additional IEG members</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ DEWHA noted that Professor Bob Johnston had recommended Ollie Dahl as first preference as an international Pulp Mill expert, that DEWHA have approached him and that he has forwarded his CV and expressed his interest and availability to fill the position. ○ IEG and DEWHA discussed and agreed that due to potential for communication and logistical difficulties it would be prudent to have 2 pulp experts. ○ It was noted by DEWHA that Bob Johnston, as a chemical and process engineer with significant expertise and experience in the industry, based in Australia was the best qualified local expert to appoint to the IEG. ○ IEG noted no objections and recommended Ollie Dahl as the international expert with Bob Johnston also recommended for appointment as additional expert. ○ DEWHA noted that they were currently preparing the brief to recommend the pulp mill experts to the Minister.
	18	<p>IEG Administration</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ DEWHA and IEG agreed IEG members would bring their own copies of documents to future IEG meetings unless they requested DEWHA to provide them. ○ IEG agreed that DEWHA should bring colour copies of relevant maps and diagrams to IEG meetings for reference.
	19	<p>Other Business</p> <p>None noted</p>
	20	<p>Next Meeting date</p>

- Next meeting was proposed for 3 October with teleconference/s proposed as required
 - IEG sought indication of what meeting would be likely to cover.
 - DEWHA responded that it may include final approval of simpler modules (C1, I-J if not approved out of session already, and D1 wharf noise study and O)
- DEWHA noted that 32, 33 was likely to require focus as a key issue

5.00	21	The chair closed the meeting at 5pm
------	-----------	-------------------------------------

Attachment A – Action Items IEG meeting 29/08/08

#	Action item	Completed ➡➡
1	ACTION: Correct draft minutes from 25 July to remove attributions (#1)	➡➡
2	ACTION: Initiate a further telephone conversation with NMI to resolve issues – a refinement of reporting and some adjustment of method. (#2)	refer to item 10.1
3	ACTION: Hold meeting with Tas Govt and Gunns when the toxicological report is complete (#3)	refer to item 10.2
4	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
5	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
6	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
7	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
8	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
9	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
10	ACTION: Gunns to include time frames on reporting arrangements and response times wherever relevant (#10).	request made – review revised modules
11	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]

EXEMPT UNDER §36